

1 James R. Condo (#005867)
2 SNELL & WILMER L.L.P.
3 One Arizona Center
4 400 E. Van Buren, Suite 1900
5 Phoenix, AZ 85004-2204
6 Telephone: (602) 382-6000
7 jcondo@swlaw.com
8
9 Richard B. North, Jr. (admitted *pro hac vice*)
10 Georgia Bar No. 545599
11 Matthew B. Lerner (admitted *pro hac vice*)
12 Georgia Bar No. 446986
13 NELSON MULLINS RILEY & SCARBOROUGH LLP
14 Atlantic Station
15 201 17th Street, NW, Suite 1700
16 Atlanta, GA 30363
17 Telephone: (404) 322-6000
18 richard.north@nelsonmullins.com
19 matthew.lerner@nelsonmullins.com
20
21 *Attorneys for Defendants*
22 *C. R. Bard, Inc. and*
23 *Bard Peripheral Vascular, Inc.*

14
15 **IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**
16
17 **FOR THE DISTRICT OF ARIZONA**

18 IN RE: Bard IVC Filters Products Liability
19 Litigation,

20 No. 2:15-MD-02641-DGC

21 This Document Relates to:

22
23 **DEFENDANTS' RESPONSE IN**
24 **OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFFS'**
25 **MOTION IN LIMINE NO. 1 TO**
26 **EXCLUDE OR LIMIT FDA**
27 **EVIDENCE THAT IS BEYOND**
28 **THE SCOPE OF THE COURT'S**
29 **ORDER**

30 (Assigned to the Honorable David G.
31 Campbell)

1 Plaintiffs move to exclude relevant FDA evidence and testimony, including certain
 2 post-market surveillance evidence and a December 1996 FDA down-classification
 3 memorandum (the “Price Memo”), that they contend is beyond the scope of the Court’s
 4 Order (Doc. 9881). This Court should deny Plaintiffs’ motion for four reasons.

5 **First**, Bard’s post-market surveillance efforts and related communications with
 6 FDA, are precisely the type of lack of FDA action evidence that this Court found relevant
 7 to negligent design and punitive damages under Georgia law, because it is probative of the
 8 reasonableness of Bard’s design decisions and lack of disregard for patient safety. *See*
 9 Docs. 10323 at 2-3; 11011 at 4-5 (“To counter [Plaintiffs’ many FDA-related arguments],
 10 Defendants should be permitted to present evidence regarding their communications with
 11 the FDA and its lack of enforcement action with respect to their filters.”); Ex. A, Final
 12 Pretrial Conf. Tr. at 33:3 to 43:7, *Booker v. C. R. Bard, Inc., et al.* (D. Ariz. Mar. 2, 2018).
 13 This evidence is equally relevant to Plaintiffs’ claims for negligent design and punitive
 14 damages under Wisconsin law.¹ *See Stevens v. Stryker Corp.*, No. 12-CV-63-bbc, 2013
 15 WL 4758948 (W.D. Wis. Sept. 4, 2013) (applying Wisconsin law) (holding that FDA
 16 regulations may inform the reasonableness of a manufacturer’s design under Wisconsin
 17 negligence law); Wis. Stat. § 895.043(3) (Punitive damages warranted only where “the
 18 defendant acted maliciously . . . or in an intentional disregard of the plaintiff’s rights.”).

19 This post-market surveillance evidence is also relevant to Plaintiffs’ strict liability
 20 design defect claim. After FDA’s multiple clearances of the Recovery® and G2® filters,
 21 Bard and FDA repeatedly communicated about the post-market performance of the
 22 devices. (*See* Pls.’ Exs. D-G, N.) This included, for example, Bard’s efforts to monitor
 23 caudal migration observed with the G2 Filter. Notwithstanding FDA’s awareness of the
 24 reported complications rates with the devices, FDA took no enforcement action with

25
 26 ¹ To the extent Plaintiffs can base their negligence per se claim on violations of the FDCA
 27 and its implementing regulations, which Bard denies, this evidence is directly probative of
 28 those claims. *See* Doc. 364 ¶ 231. For example, Trial Exhibits 5879-5881, and 5003 (Pls.’
 Exs. D-G, N) concerning Bard’s DFMEA and Dear Colleague Letter are directly
 probative of Bard’s alleged violations of the quality systems regulations, 21 C.F.R. § 820
et seq., and any alleged violations of 21 U.S.C. § 321, and 21 C.F.R. §§ 803, 807.

1 respect to the Recovery or G2 filters. This evidence is relevant to Bard's decision to adopt
 2 the design of the G2®X (G2 with snarable tip) and Eclipse® (electropolished G2X) filters
 3 over other alleged "reasonable alternative design[s]," whether Bard's "omission of the
 4 alternative design renders [the G2X or Eclipse] not reasonably safe," Wis. Stat.
 5 § 895.047(1)(a), and whether Bard's decision to continue to sell the devices was
 6 reasonable.

7 Similarly, the Price Memo (Pls.' Ex. H) is probative of Plaintiffs' claims, as it
 8 evidences FDA's and the medical community's acknowledgment of known risks
 9 (including those at issue in this case) and acceptable complication rates for IVC filters as
 10 reported in the literature. This is highly relevant to establish that the alleged "damage
 11 [here] was caused by an inherent characteristic of the product" that was well known "to
 12 the community that uses [IVC filters]." Wis. Stat. § 895.047(3)(d). This is also relevant to
 13 Bard's decision to adopt the specific design of the G2X and Eclipse over other alleged
 14 alternative designs because Bard's G2 EVEREST clinical rates fell within this accepted
 15 range. *See* Wis. Stat. § 895.047(1)(a).² The Price Memo is further relevant to other issues
 16 because: (1) it explains why IVC filters are subject to 510(k), rather than PMA, review,
 17 rebutting Plaintiffs' arguments in opening that Bard "chose this path of clearance, not
 18 approval"³ and otherwise criticizing Bard's pre-market testing; (2) it evidences FDA's
 19 acknowledgment of the benefits of IVC filter use, rebutting Plaintiffs' argument that IVC
 20 filters lack efficacy; and (3) it explains why FDA promulgated the IVC Filter Guidance,
 21 with which all of Bard's IVC filter 510(k) submissions complied.

22 **Second**, Plaintiffs offer no new argument for exclusion of this relevant evidence.
 23 This Court has already heard and addressed Plaintiffs' arguments that they are prejudiced
 24 because "Plaintiffs are precluded from deposing FDA officials." (Mot. at 2.) The Court

25 ² *See also Restatement (Third) of Torts: Prod. Liab.* § 2, cmt. d (1998) ("Assessment of a
 26 product design [requires] comparison between an alternative design and the product
 27 design that caused the injury, undertaken from the viewpoint of a reasonable person."); *id.*
 28 at cmt. f (some factors to consider whether omission of alternative design rendered the
 product not reasonably safe include: "the magnitude and probability of the foreseeable
 risks of harm" and "the instructions and warnings accompanying the product").

³ Ex. B, Trial Tr. Day 1, at 145:1-8, *Booker v. C. R. Bard, Inc.* (D. Ariz. Mar. 14, 2018).

1 concluded that “Plaintiffs have ample evidence to contest Defendants’ assertions that they
 2 were fully transparent with the FDA.” Doc. 10323 at 3; *see also* Ex. A at 41:1 to 42:2
 3 (“Plaintiffs have been thorough in deposing every witness who claims to have
 4 communicated with the FDA, and obtaining every document that was shared with the
 5 FDA, and identifying lots of evidence that . . . was not shared with the FDA, [and have
 6 two regulatory] experts who will opine about what the FDA does and does not do.”). The
 7 probative value of this evidence substantially outweighs any danger of unfair prejudice.

8 **Third,** Plaintiffs misinterpret the scope of this Court’s Order (Doc. 9881), which
 9 addressed only Plaintiffs’ specific request to exclude two categories of evidence: (1) FDA
 10 510(k) clearance, and (2) lack of FDA enforcement action. *See* Docs 9881 at 1; 9529,
 11 9824. Plaintiffs did not move to exclude, nor did the Court rule on the admissibility of, all
 12 FDA or “regulatory evidence.” Moreover, the Court did not limit Bard’s use of FDA
 13 evidence only to such evidence “relevant to the 510(k) clearance process.” (Mot. at 2.)
 14 Additionally, Plaintiffs ignore the other half of the Court’s Order and subsequent rulings
 15 denying their request to exclude evidence of lack of FDA action. *See* Docs. 9881; 10323
 16 at 2-3; 11011 at 4-5. In short, most of the evidence Plaintiffs seek to exclude here falls
 17 squarely within the lack of FDA action category and is relevant to the issues in this case.

18 **Fourth,** Plaintiffs move to exclude any “gratuitous” testimony concerning “FDA
 19 communications unrelated to the 510(k) process.” (Mot. at 3.) It is unclear to Bard what
 20 testimony Plaintiffs seek to exclude. But Bard submits that its communications with FDA
 21 are relevant to provide context for the reasonableness of Bard’s actions and state of mind
 22 in designing the G2X and Eclipse over other reasonable alternative designs. *See* Doc.
 23 11011 at 4 (“Defendants should be permitted to present evidence regarding their
 24 communications with the FDA.”).⁴ Nor is it possible for Bard to respond to or the Court to
 25 rule on this vague request without the context in which the testimony is offered at trial.

26
 27 ⁴ Plaintiffs’ assertion that Bard’s witnesses testified “directly that its filters were *deemed*
 28 safe and effective” is inaccurate. (Mot. at 3 (emphasis added).) That Mr. Carr personally
 believes that retrievable filters “are safe and effective” is a far cry from testifying that they
 were “deemed” so by FDA. (Pls.’ Ex. M.)

1 For these reasons, Bard respectfully requests that the Court deny this Motion.
2

3 RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED this 28th day of August, 2018.
4

5 *s/ Richard B. North, Jr.*
6

7 Richard B. North, Jr.
8 Georgia Bar No. 545599
9 Matthew B. Lerner
10 Georgia Bar No. 446986
11 NELSON MULLINS RILEY & SCARBOROUGH, LLP
12 Atlantic Station
13 201 17th Street, NW / Suite 1700
14 Atlanta, GA 30363
15 PH: (404) 322-6000
16 FX: (404) 322-6050
17 richard.north@nelsonmullins.com
18 matthew.lerner@nelsonmullins.com

19 James R. Condo (#005867)
20 SNELL & WILMER L.L.P.
21 One Arizona Center
22 400 E. Van Buren
23 Phoenix, AZ 85004-2204
24 PH: (602) 382-6000
25 jcondo@swlaw.com

26 **Attorneys for Defendants C. R. Bard, Inc. and**
27 **Bard Peripheral Vascular, Inc.**

28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65
66
67
68
69
70
71
72
73
74
75
76
77
78
79
80
81
82
83
84
85
86
87
88
89
90
91
92
93
94
95
96
97
98
99
100
101
102
103
104
105
106
107
108
109
110
111
112
113
114
115
116
117
118
119
120
121
122
123
124
125
126
127
128
129
130
131
132
133
134
135
136
137
138
139
140
141
142
143
144
145
146
147
148
149
150
151
152
153
154
155
156
157
158
159
160
161
162
163
164
165
166
167
168
169
170
171
172
173
174
175
176
177
178
179
180
181
182
183
184
185
186
187
188
189
190
191
192
193
194
195
196
197
198
199
200
201
202
203
204
205
206
207
208
209
210
211
212
213
214
215
216
217
218
219
220
221
222
223
224
225
226
227
228
229
230
231
232
233
234
235
236
237
238
239
240
241
242
243
244
245
246
247
248
249
250
251
252
253
254
255
256
257
258
259
260
261
262
263
264
265
266
267
268
269
270
271
272
273
274
275
276
277
278
279
280
281
282
283
284
285
286
287
288
289
290
291
292
293
294
295
296
297
298
299
300
301
302
303
304
305
306
307
308
309
310
311
312
313
314
315
316
317
318
319
320
321
322
323
324
325
326
327
328
329
330
331
332
333
334
335
336
337
338
339
340
341
342
343
344
345
346
347
348
349
350
351
352
353
354
355
356
357
358
359
360
361
362
363
364
365
366
367
368
369
370
371
372
373
374
375
376
377
378
379
380
381
382
383
384
385
386
387
388
389
390
391
392
393
394
395
396
397
398
399
400
401
402
403
404
405
406
407
408
409
410
411
412
413
414
415
416
417
418
419
420
421
422
423
424
425
426
427
428
429
430
431
432
433
434
435
436
437
438
439
440
441
442
443
444
445
446
447
448
449
450
451
452
453
454
455
456
457
458
459
460
461
462
463
464
465
466
467
468
469
470
471
472
473
474
475
476
477
478
479
480
481
482
483
484
485
486
487
488
489
490
491
492
493
494
495
496
497
498
499
500
501
502
503
504
505
506
507
508
509
510
511
512
513
514
515
516
517
518
519
520
521
522
523
524
525
526
527
528
529
530
531
532
533
534
535
536
537
538
539
540
541
542
543
544
545
546
547
548
549
550
551
552
553
554
555
556
557
558
559
560
561
562
563
564
565
566
567
568
569
570
571
572
573
574
575
576
577
578
579
580
581
582
583
584
585
586
587
588
589
590
591
592
593
594
595
596
597
598
599
600
601
602
603
604
605
606
607
608
609
610
611
612
613
614
615
616
617
618
619
620
621
622
623
624
625
626
627
628
629
630
631
632
633
634
635
636
637
638
639
640
641
642
643
644
645
646
647
648
649
650
651
652
653
654
655
656
657
658
659
660
661
662
663
664
665
666
667
668
669
670
671
672
673
674
675
676
677
678
679
680
681
682
683
684
685
686
687
688
689
690
691
692
693
694
695
696
697
698
699
700
701
702
703
704
705
706
707
708
709
710
711
712
713
714
715
716
717
718
719
720
721
722
723
724
725
726
727
728
729
730
731
732
733
734
735
736
737
738
739
740
741
742
743
744
745
746
747
748
749
750
751
752
753
754
755
756
757
758
759
760
761
762
763
764
765
766
767
768
769
770
771
772
773
774
775
776
777
778
779
780
781
782
783
784
785
786
787
788
789
790
791
792
793
794
795
796
797
798
799
800
801
802
803
804
805
806
807
808
809
8010
8011
8012
8013
8014
8015
8016
8017
8018
8019
8020
8021
8022
8023
8024
8025
8026
8027
8028
8029
8030
8031
8032
8033
8034
8035
8036
8037
8038
8039
8040
8041
8042
8043
8044
8045
8046
8047
8048
8049
8050
8051
8052
8053
8054
8055
8056
8057
8058
8059
8060
8061
8062
8063
8064
8065
8066
8067
8068
8069
8070
8071
8072
8073
8074
8075
8076
8077
8078
8079
8080
8081
8082
8083
8084
8085
8086
8087
8088
8089
8090
8091
8092
8093
8094
8095
8096
8097
8098
8099
80100
80101
80102
80103
80104
80105
80106
80107
80108
80109
80110
80111
80112
80113
80114
80115
80116
80117
80118
80119
80120
80121
80122
80123
80124
80125
80126
80127
80128
80129
80130
80131
80132
80133
80134
80135
80136
80137
80138
80139
80140
80141
80142
80143
80144
80145
80146
80147
80148
80149
80150
80151
80152
80153
80154
80155
80156
80157
80158
80159
80160
80161
80162
80163
80164
80165
80166
80167
80168
80169
80170
80171
80172
80173
80174
80175
80176
80177
80178
80179
80180
80181
80182
80183
80184
80185
80186
80187
80188
80189
80190
80191
80192
80193
80194
80195
80196
80197
80198
80199
80200
80201
80202
80203
80204
80205
80206
80207
80208
80209
80210
80211
80212
80213
80214
80215
80216
80217
80218
80219
80220
80221
80222
80223
80224
80225
80226
80227
80228
80229
80230
80231
80232
80233
80234
80235
80236
80237
80238
80239
80240
80241
80242
80243
80244
80245
80246
80247
80248
80249
80250
80251
80252
80253
80254
80255
80256
80257
80258
80259
80260
80261
80262
80263
80264
80265
80266
80267
80268
80269
80270
80271
80272
80273
80274
80275
80276
80277
80278
80279
80280
80281
80282
80283
80284
80285
80286
80287
80288
80289
80290
80291
80292
80293
80294
80295
80296
80297
80298
80299
80200
80201
80202
80203
80204
80205
80206
80207
80208
80209
80210
80211
80212
80213
80214
80215
80216
80217
80218
80219
80220
80221
80222
80223
80224
80225
80226
80227
80228
80229
80230
80231
80232
80233
80234
80235
80236
80237
80238
80239
80240
80241
80242
80243
80244
80245
80246
80247
80248
80249
80250
80251
80252
80253
80254
80255
80256
80257
80258
80259
80260
80261
80262
80263
80264
80265
80266
80267
80268
80269
80270
80271
80272
80273
80274
80275
80276
80277
80278
80279
80280
80281
80282
80283
80284
80285
80286
80287
80288
80289
80290
80291
80292
80293
80294
80295
80296
80297
80298
80299
80200
80201
80202
80203
80204
80205
80206
80207
80208
80209
80210
80211
80212
80213
80214
80215
80216
80217
80218
80219
80220
80221
80222
80223
80224
80225
80226
80227
80228
80229
80230
80231
80232
80233
80234
80235
80236
80237
80238
80239
80240
80241
80242
80243
80244
80245
80246
80247
80248
80249
80250
80251
80252
80253
80254
80255
80256
80257
80258
80259
80260
80261
80262
80263
80264
80265
80266
80267
80268
80269
80270
80271
80272
80273
80274
80275
80276
80277
80278
80279
80280
80281
80282
80283
80284
80285
80286
80287
80288
80289
80290
80291
80292
80293
80294
80295
80296
80297
80298
80299
80200
80201
80202
80203
80204
80205
80206
80207
80208
80209
80210
80211
80212
80213
80214
80215
80216
80217
80218
80219
80220
80221
80222
80223
80224
80225
80226
80227
80228
80229
80230
80231
80232
80233
80234
80235
80236
80237
80238
80239
80240
80241
80242
80243
80244
80245
80246
80247
80248
80249
80250
80251
80252
80253
80254
80255
80256
80257
80258
80259
80260
80261
80262
80263
80264
80265
80266
80267
80268
80269
80270
80271
80272
80273
80274
80275
80276
80277
80278
80279
80280
80281
80282
80283
80284
80285
80286
80287
80288
80289
80290
80291
80292
80293
80294
80295
80296
80297
80298
80299
80200
80201
80202
80203
80204
80205
80206
80207
80208
80209
80210
80211
80212
80213
80214
80215
80216
80217
80218
80219
80220
80221
80222
80223
80224
80225
80226
80227
80228
80229
80230
80231
80232
80233
80234
80235
80236
80237
80238
80239
80240
80241
80242
80243
80244
80245
80246
80247
80248
80249
80250
80251
80252
80253
80254
80255
80256
80257
80258
80259
80260
80261
80262
80263
80264
80265
80266
80267
80268
80269
80270
80271
80272
80273
80274
80275
80276
80277
80278
80279
80280
80281
80282
80283
80284
80285
80286
80287
80288
80289
80290
80291
80292
80293
80294
80295
80296
80297
80298
80299
80200
80201
80202
80203
80204
80205
80206
80207
80208
80209
80210
80211
80212
80213
80214
80215
80216
80217
80218
80219
80220
80221
80222
80223
80224
80225
80226
80227
80228
80229
80230
80231
80232
80233
80234
80235
80236
80237
80238
80239
80240
80241
80242
80243
80244
80245
80246
80247
80248
80249
80250
80251
80252
80253
80254
80255
80256
80257
80258
80259
80260
80261
80262
80263
80264
80265
80266
80267
80268
80269
80270
80271
80272
80273
80274
80275
80276
80277
80278
80279
80280
80281
80282
80283
80284
80285
80286
80287
80288
80289
80290
80291
80292
80293
80294
80295
80296
80297
80298
80299
80200
80201
80202
80203
80204
80205
80206
80207
80208
80209
80210
80211
80212
80213
80214
80215
80216
80217
80218
80219
80220
80221
80222
80223
80224
80225
80226
80227
80228
80229
80230
80231
80232
80233
80234
80235
80236
80237
80238
80239
80240
80241
80242
80243
80244
80245
80246
80247
80248
80249
80250
80251
80252
80253
80254
80255
80256
80257
80258
80259
80260
80261
80262
80263
80264
80265
80266
80267
80268
80269
80270
80271
80272
80273
80274
80275
80276
80277
80278
80279
80280
80281
80282
80283
80284
80285
80286
80287
80288
80289
80290
80291
80292
80293
80294
80295
80296
80297
80298
80299
80200
80201
80202
80203
80204
80205
80206
80207
80208
80209
80210
80211
80212
80213
80214
80215
80216
80217
80218
80219
80220
80221
80222
80223
80224
80225
80226
80227
80228
80229
80230
80231
80232
80233
80234
80235
80236
80237
80238
80239
80240
80241
80242
80243
80244
80245
80246
80247
80248
80249
80250
80251
80252
80253
80254
80255
80256
80257
80258
80259
80260
80261
80262
80263
80264
80265
80266
80267
80268
80269
80270
80271
80272
80273
80274
80275
80276
80277
80278
80279
80280
80281
80282
80283
80284
80285
80286
80287
80288
80289
80290
80291
80292
80293
80294
80295
80296
80297
80298
80299
80200
80201
80202
80203
80204
80205
8020

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on this 28th day of August 2018, the foregoing was electronically filed with the Clerk of Court using the CM/ECF system which will automatically send e-mail notification of such filing to all attorneys of record.

s/Richard B. North, Jr.
Richard B. North, Jr.